



INTRODUCTION DIGITAL IQ INDEX® **BEAUTY**



Robust

E-commerce growth is robust in the \$32 billion¹ U.S. Beauty industry, accounting for eight percent of sales.² For Estée Lauder, the number is higher: 12 percent in the U.S., and eight percent globally (roughly \$800 million).^{3,4} L'Oréal is poised to break the \$1 billion mark in online sales across markets in FY 2015.⁵

Seven Dwarves

But brand.com e-commerce remains a sliver of the \$300 billion U.S. e-commerce market. The top 10 e-commerce players in the U.S.—mostly retailers—clock half of e-commerce sales, and the top four command 40 percent of e-commerce sales. The goliaths? Amazon, Apple, Walmart, and Staples, with Amazon responsible for a full quarter of online sales. The Seattle behemoth registered \$72 billion in web sales in 2014⁶ and 28 percent growth in the most recent quarter, vs. Walmart's 10 percent.^{7,8} E-commerce is becoming Amazon and the seven dwarves.

Despite inroads of brand sites, the majority of online shoppers prefer to purchase through retailers—70 percent.⁹ L'Oréal reports one-quarter of online sales come directly from the brand, but three-quarters come from retailer sites.¹⁰ Put in context, Estée Lauder's combined \$600 million of web sales from brand sites in 2014 pales in comparison to the individual e-commerce revenue streams of its department-store partners (e.g., Macy's \$5.4bb, Nordstrom \$2.5bb). Brand sites have become the journey, but not the destination, for purchase: Amazon is among the top five downstream destinations for 45 percent of Index sites, vs. Sephora, at 15 percent.

1. Euromonitor.

2. NPD Group.

- 3. "Estee Lauder's Digital, China and Retail Goals," CEW Beauty Insider, September 15, 2015.
- 4. "Estee Lauder wants more South Korean web sales," Mark Brohan, Internet Retailer, October 27, 2015.
- 5. "L'Oreal projects one billion euros in e-commerce sales in 2015," Matt Lindner, Internet Retailer, August 4, 2015.
- "E-commerce sales grow six times faster for U.S. Top 500 merchants than total retail sales," Mark Brohan, Internet Retailer, April 13, 2015.
- "<u>Amazon posts second straight profit powered by Web Services.</u>" Anya George Tharakan and Alexandria Sage, Reuters, October 22, 2015.
- "The Big Cloud Hanging Over Walmart's Improving Sales? Soft E-commerce Growth," Phil Wahba, Fortune, November 17, 2015.
- 9. "2015 Digital Consumer Preferences Survey," BrandShop, September 17, 2015.
- 10. "Online Beauty: L'Oréal's E-Commerce Strategy." L'Oréal Monthly Digest, November 2015.

Beauty: Estée Lauder Sales vs. Department Store Sales In Billions

2014 All Sales Total E-Commerce Sales



Beauty: Comparative Rank of Amazon vs. Sephora in Outbound Traffic from Brand.com

September 2015, n= 95 Beauty Brand Sites 📃 Top 5 Destination 📕 Top 3 Destination



Source: L2 Commerce IQ[®].

New Arbiter

Instagram is the coolest platform on the block, with retail concepts dedicated to selling Beauty products that are trending on the platform.¹¹ More tellingly, there is a correlation between offline success and engagement on Instagram. Index newcomer Anastasia Beverly Hills, which posts 62 photos per week on Instagram and claims a third of total share of voice on the platform, has translated online engagement into sales growth: it's the fastest growing prestige brand in off- and online sales.¹²

Reaching the millennial consumer has become a key initiative for brands millennial women are among the most voracious consumers.¹³ Estée Lauder's 19 mentions of "millennial" in its latest Annual Report compared with none last year is a barometer for the industry. The flagship brand's partnership with Kendall Jenner in 2014 was a deft move—the average @esteelauder Instagram photo featuring the model registers twenty times the engagement of a non-Kendall photo.

Thunderdome

Video's influence remains in full force in Beauty. While brands are advertising on both Facebook and YouTube, vloggers still favor YouTube which now boasts two million Beauty videos in English, half dedicated to make-up.¹⁴ Earned media remains a powerful vehicle for brand awareness and path to purchase: 23 percent of heavy Beauty purchasers indicate that YouTube specifically is important to their purchase decisions.¹⁵ But brand-owned content requires extensive paid support to achieve a fraction of the views that vloggers command organically. A strong video strategy coupled with authentic creative is a powerful cocktail as Facebook and YouTube offer more views to brands in the thunderdome showdown for video supremacy.¹⁶

11. "<u>New York City beauty retailer sells only makeup discovered on Instagram</u>," Deanna Utroske, CosmeticsDesign.com USA, August 25, 2015.

- 12. "Independent Beauty Brands Seeing Big Growth Within Prestige Beauty." NPD Group, July 27, 2015.
- 13. "2014 Beauty Consumer Insights Study." TABS Group, December 18, 2014.
- 14. "Beauty on YouTube," Pixability, 2015.
- "2014 Beauty Consumer Insights Study," TABS Group, December 18, 2014.
 "Facebook video ads are coming so look out, YouTube," Patrick Kulp, Mashable, July 1, 2015.

Digital IQ = Shareholder Value

This year's Digital IQ Index[®] benchmarks 106 U.S. Beauty brands across the Color Cosmetics, Fragrance, Nail, and Skincare categories. Our aim is to provide a robust tool to diagnose digital strengths and weaknesses, helping managers achieve greater return on incremental investment. Like the medium we are assessing, our approach is dynamic. Please reach out with comments to help improve our methodology and findings.

Regards, L2

Beauty: Buzzword Mentions in Estée Lauder Annual Reports

2014–2015 📃 2014 🔳 2015



Source: L2 Digital IQ Index®: Beauty, December 2015.

ABOUT THE RANKING

Methodology

SITE & E-COMMERCE



BRAND.COM

Navigation, Search, Technology: Load Time, Analytics, Video Content, Guided Selling Tools, UGC, Site Search, Sorts & Filters

Product Merchandising: Content, Video, Usage & Ingredients, User Reviews, Cross-Selling

Customer Service & Account: Contact Us, Live Chat, User Account, Loyalty Program, Store Locator

E-Commerce: Third-Party Handoff*, Ease of Checkout, Shipping & Returns, Auto-Replenishment

RETAILER.COM*:

Classification

Merchandising, Review Count Discoverability & Visibility Amazon, Walmart, Target, Nordstrom, Macy's, Sephora, Ulta

Amazon Gray Market Cleanup (Prestige Beauty Only)

DIGITAL MARKETING

25%

Brand Search: Traffic, Web Authority, SEO/SEM

Category Search: Frequency of Appearance & Search Rank on Category-Specific Keywords

Web Advertising: Impressions & Creative Units on Desktop Display & Video Pre-Roll (Pathmatics), Share of Traffic from Display

Earned Media: Brand Mentions Across Beauty-Specific Communities

Email:

Ease of Signup, Incentives, Frequency, Content, Trigger Emails, Mobile Optimization, Personalization Efforts

MOBILE & TABLET

20%

Mobile Site: Compatibility, Functionality, Mobile Feature Set, M-Commerce

Tablet Experience:Responsiveness, UI/UX Optimizationfor Touch Input, Checkout &Cart Persistence

Mobile Advertising & Innovation: Impressions & Creative Units on Mobile & Tablet Browsers (Pathmatics), Apps*

Mobile Search: "Above-the-Fold" Visibility, "Mobile-Friendly" Designation, Paid Search Extensions

SOCIAL MEDIA

15%

Facebook: Reach, Engagement, Programming, Native Video

YouTube: Search Visibility, Channel Experience, Total Video Views, Paid Support

Instagram: Reach, Engagement, Programming, #Brand Mentions

Twitter: Reach, Engagement, Tweet Frequency

Emerging Platforms: Pinterest

* If Applicable

GENIUS 140+	GIFTED 110–139	AVERAGE 90-109	CHALLENGED 70-89	FEEBLE <70
Digital competence is a point of competitive differentiation for these brands. Creatively engineered messaging reaches consumers on a variety of devices and in many	Brands are experimenting and innovating across site, mobile, and social platforms. Digital presence is consistent with brand image and	Digital presence is functional yet predictable. Efforts are often siloed across platforms.	Limited or inconsistent adoption of mobile and social media platforms. Sites lack inspiration and utility.	Investment does not match opportunity.

December 17, 2015

online environments.

DIGITAL IQ INDEX® BEAUTY

IN THE COMPANY OF GENIUS GIFTED

RANK	BRAND	DIGITAL IQ	RANK	BRAND	DIGITAL IQ	RANK	BRAND	DIGITAL IQ
1	URBANDECAY boaulgrwilf ag olfge* L'Oréal Group	149	6	CLINIQUE The Estée Lauder Companies	138	12	Sally Hansen Coty, Inc.	133
2	MAYBELLINE New YORK	145	6	The Estée Lauder Companies	138	14	bareMinerals Shiseido Co., Ltd.	132
3	L'ORÉAL L'Oréal Group	144	8	sixce Kichl's 1881 L'Oréal Group	137	15	smashbox The Estée Lauder Companies	131
3	LANCÔME L'Oréal Group	144	9	ESTEE LAUDER The Estée Lauder Companies	135	16	$A \vee O N$ Avon Products, Inc.	130
5	ban FAANCESCO FIT	142	10	COVERGIRL Procter & Gamble	134	16	O·P·I Coty, Inc.	130
			10	OLAY* Procter & Gamble	134	18	Neutrogena [®] Johnson & Johnson, Inc.	129
			12	BOBBI BROWN The Estée Lauder Companies	133	19	ESSIC L'Oréal Group	124

Urban Decay Maybelline New York L'Oréal Paris Lancôme Benefit Cosmetics GIFTED Clinique MAC Cosmetics Kiehl's Kiehl's Estée Lauder CoverGirl Olay Bobbi Brown Sally Hansen bareMinerals Smashbox Cosmetics Avon Avon OPI Neutrogena Essie NYX NYX Too Faced Chanel Dior Dove Dove NARS Cosmetics Origins Philosophy Tarte Cosmetics L'Occitane en Provence Revion Revion Giorgio Armani Beauty Aveda Make Up For Ever Shiseido e.l.f. Cosmetics Garnier Proactiv Charlotte Tilbury Charlotte Tilbury Clarisonic Clarisonic Clarins Laura Mercier Murad Kat Von D AVERAGE AVEHAGE Calvin Klein Dolce & Gabbana Vichy Victoria's Secret Fresh Simple Dermalogica Skinceuticals Jo Malone YSL Beauty Gucci Jo Malone Jo Malone VSL Beauty Gucci La Noche-Yosay Dermablend Dermablend Seiti Stila Cosmetics Strivectin Strivectin Strivectin Burberry Rimmel London Crinistan Louboutin Kate Somerville Marc. Jacobs Beauty Elizabeth Arden Marc. Jacobs Beauty Elizabeth Arden Marc. Jacobs Beauty Prada Ret Skincare Wet 'n Wild Anastasia Beventy Hills Formula S Cosmetics Nivea CHALLENGED Jimmy Choo butter London Sisley Bite Beauty Bite Beauty Hugo Boss Juicy Couture Trish McEvoy Almay Guerlain Ole Henriksen Pond's Viktor & Rolf GLAMGLOW LaMbLOW Lacoste DKNY Fragrances Donna Karan New York Color BECCA Cosmetics Eau Thermale Avène Nina Ricci

Issey Miyake Parfums Jean Paul Gaultier Vera Wang Fragrances

5

5

GENIUS

DIGITAL IQ INDEX® BEAUTY

GIFTED

RANK	BRAND	DIGITAL IQ	RANK	BRAND	DIGITAL IQ	RANK	BRAND	DIGITAL IQ
19	NYX L'Oréal Group	124	27	philosophy [*] ^{Coty, Inc.}	120	32	Shiseido Co., Ltd.	116
19	Too Faced COSMETICS TOO Faced Cosmetics, LLC	124	28	tarte high-performance naturals [.] KOSÉ Corp.	119	35	even ipe face J.A. Cosmetics US, Inc.	115
22	CHANEL Chanel S.A.	123	29	L'OCCITANE The L'OCCITANE Group	118	36	GARNICR L'Oréal Group	114
22		123	29	REVLON Revion, Inc.	118	36	proactiv + Guthy-Renker LLC	114
22	Dove	123	31	GIORGIO ARMANI L'Oréal Group	117	38	Charlotte Tilbury Charlotte Tilbury Beauty, Inc.	113
22	Shiseido Co., Ltd.	123	32	AVEDA The Estée Lauder Companies	116	38	clariĝonic L'Oréal Group	113
26	ORIGINS The Estée Lauder Companies	122	32	MAKE UP FOR EVER	116	40	CLARINS Clarins SA	112

GLAMGLUW Lacoste DKNY Fragrances Donna Karan New York Color BECCA Cosmetics Eau Thermale Avène Nina Ricci

Issey Miyake Parfums Jean Paul Gaultier Vera Wang Fragrances

6

DIGITAL IQ INDEX® BEAUTY

AVERAGE GIFTED DDAND

RANK	BRAND	DIGITAL IQ	RANK	BRAND	DIGITAL IQ	RANK	BRAND
40	BULA MERCIER	112	48	fresh.	107	54	LA MER The Estée Lauder Companies
40	Murad.	112	48	Unilever	107	54	LA ROCHE-POSAY LABORATORE DERMATOLOGIQUE L'Oréal Group
43	・ 派行 Hon 月・ LVMH (Kendo Holdings Inc)	110	50	dermalogica °	106	57	PROFESSION
44	Calvin Klein _{Coty, Inc.}	109	50	Skin Ceuticals ¹ L'Oréal Group	106	57	MARY KAY Mary Kay
44	DOLCE & GABBANA	109	52	Jo MALONE LONDON The Estée Lauder Companies	105	57	RALPH LAUREN
44	LABORATOTRES L'Oréal Group	109	52	VESSAINT AURENT	105	57	SK-II Procter & Gamble
44	VICTORIA'S SECRET Limited Brands	109	54	GUCCI Procter & Gamble	104	57	stila cosmetics Patriarch Partners, LLC

GENIUS Urban Decay Maybelline New York L'Oréal Paris Lancôme Benefit Cosmetics GIFTED Gin FED Clinique MAC Cosmetics Kiehl's Estée Lauder CoverGirl Olay Bobbi Brown Sally Hansen bareMinerals bareMinerals Smashbox Cosmetics Neutrogena Essie NYX Too Faced Chanel Dior Dove Dove NARS Cosmetics Origins Philosophy Tarte Cosmetics L'Occitane en Provence Revion Revion Giorgio Armani Beauty Aveda Make Up For Ever Shiseido e.l.f. Cosmetics Garnier Proactiv Charlotte Tilbury Clariconic Clarisonic Clarins Laura Mercier Murad Kat Von D AVERAGE Calvin Klein Dolce & Gabbana Dolce & Gabbana Vichy Victoria's Secret Fresh Simple Dermalogica Skinceuticals Jo Malone YSL Beauty Curci YSL Beauty Gucci La Mer La Roche-Posay Dermablend Mary Kay Ralph Lauren Fragrances SK-II Ralph Lauren Fragränces SK-II SK-II Stila Cosmetics Stila Cosmetics StriVectin Aveeno Burberry Rimmel London Burberry Rimmel London Burber Michael Kors Perricone Min Deborat Le Pratie Perricone Michael Kors Perricone Min Deborat Le Pratie Perricone Min Deborat Le Pratie Parta REN Skincare Wet 'n 'Wid Anastasia Beverly Hills Formula X Marc Jacobs Fragrance Hourglass Cosmetics Nivea ChalLeNGED CHALLENGED Jimmy Choo butter London Sisley Bite Beauty Hugo Boss Juicy Couture Trish McEvoy Almay Guerlain Ole Henriksen Pond's Viktor & Rolf GLAMGLOW LaMbLOW Lacoste DKNY Fragrances Donna Karan New York Color BECCA Cosmetics Eau Thermale Avène Nina Ricci

Issey Miyake Parfums Jean Paul Gaultier Vera Wang Fragrances

7

DIGITAL IQ

104

104

103

103

DIGITAL IQ INDEX® BEAUTY

AVERAGE

RANK	BRAND	DIGITAL IQ	RANK	BRAND	DIGITAL IQ	RANK	BRAND	DIGITAL IQ
57	StriVectin [®] StriVectin Operating Company, Inc.	103	69	Elizabeth Arden Elizabeth Arden, Inc.	98	75	CLEAN SKINCARE	94
63	Johnson & Johnson, Inc.	102	69	MICHAEL KORS The Estée Lauder Companies	98	75	Wet n wild	94
64	BURBERRY Burberry Group	101	71	Perricone MD	97	78	A N A S T A S I A Secondly Yulls* Anastasia Beverly Hills, Inc.	93
64	RIMMEL Coty, Inc.	101	72	deborah lippmann. Lippmann Enterprises, LLC	96	79	Formula x LVMH (Kendo Holdings Inc)	92
66	Christian Louboutin LLC	99	73	la prairie switzenLAND Beiersdorf AG	95	79	MARC JACOBS FRAGRANCES	92
66	Kate Somerville Son Hwath Experts Unilever	99	73	Thierry Mugler Clarins SA	95	81	HOURGLASS Hourglass Cosmetics	91
66	MARC JACOBS BEAUTY LVMH (Kendo Holdings Inc)	99	75	PRADA Puig SL	94	82	NIVEÁ Beiersdorf AG	90

GENIUS Urban Decay Mavbelline New York L'Oréal Paris Lancôme Benefit Cosmetics GIFTED GIFTED Clinique MAC Cosmetics Kiehl's Estée Lauder CoverGirl Olay Bobbi Brown Sally Hansen bareMinerals Smashbox Cosmetics Neutrogena Essie NYX Too Faced Chanel Dior Dove Dove NARS Cosmetics Origins Philosophy Tarte Cosmetics L'Occitane en Provence Revion Revion Giorgio Armani Beauty Aveda Make Up For Ever Shiseido e.l.f. Cosmetics Garnier Proactiv Charlotte Tilbury Charlotte Tilbury Clarisonic Clarisonic Clarins Laura Mercier Murad Kat Von D AVERAGE Calvin Klein Dolce & Gabbana Uoice & Gabbana Victoria's Secret Fresh Simple Dermalogica Skinceuticals Jo Malone YSL Beauty Guera Jo Malone VSL Beauty Gucci La Nothe-Yosay Dermablend Seriel Stila Cosmetics Strivectin Strivectin Strivectin Burberry Rimmel London Crinistan Louboutin Kate Somerville Marc. Jacobs Beauty Elizabeth Arden Marc. Jacobs Beauty Elizabeth Arden Marc. Jacobs Beauty Burberry Burberry Rimmel Lindon Crinistan Louboutin Kate Somerville Marc. Jacobs Beauty Prada Ret Skincare Wet 'n Wild Anastasia Beyenty Hills Formula S Cosmetics Nivea Nive CHALLENGED Jimmy Choo butter London Sisley Bite Beauty Bite Beauty Hugo Boss Juicy Couture Trish McEvoy Almay Guerlain Ole Henriksen Pond's Viktor & Rolf GLAMGLOW Lacoste GLAMGLOW Lacoste DKNY Fragrances Donna Karan New York Color BECCA Cosmetics Eau Thermale Avène Nina Ricci

Nina Ricci FEEBLE Issey Miyake Parfums Jean Paul Gaultier Vera Wang Fragrances 8

DIGITAL IQ INDEX® BEAUTY

CHALLENGED

RANK	BRAND	DIGITAL IQ	RANK	BRAND	DIGITAL IQ	RANK	BRAND	DIGITAL IQ
83	ARTISTRY [.] Amway	88	90	Trish McEvoy	83	96	LACOSTE	75
83	JIMMY CHOO Inter-Parfums, Inc.	88	91	ALMAY. Revion, Inc.	82	98	DKNY The Estée Lauder Companies	74
85	butter London LLC	86	92	GUERLAIN Paris	80	99	DonnaKaran Newyork The Estée Lauder Companies	73
86	S I S L E Y Sisley Cosmetics USA, Inc.	85	92	OLE HENRIKSEN LVMH (Kendo Holdings Inc)	80	99	NEWYORKCOLOR Coty, Inc.	73
87	BITE	84	94	POND'S •	77	101	BECCA, Inc.	71
87	нидо воѕѕ Procter & Gamble	84	95	VIKTOR ROLF L'Oréal Group	76	102	EAU THERMALE Avène Pierre Fabre	70
87	Juicy Couture Elizabeth Arden, Inc.	84	96	GLAMGLOW * The Estée Lauder Companies	75	102	NINA RICCI Puig SL	70



5

GIFTED Clinique MAC Cosmetics Kiehl's Estée Lauder CoverGirl Olay Bobbi Brown Sally Hansen bareMinerals

Smashbox Cosmetics Avon OPI Neutrogena Essie NYX NYX Too Faced Chanel Dior Dove

Dove NARS Cosmetics Origins Philosophy Tarte Cosmetics L'Occitane en Provence Revion

Revion Giorgio Armani Beauty Aveda Make Up For Ever Shiseido e.l.f. Cosmetics Garnier Proactiv Charlotte Tilbury Charlotte Tilbury

Clarisonic Clarisonic Clarins Laura Mercier Murad Kat Von D AVERAGE Calvin Klein Dolce & Gabbana

Dolce & Gabbana Vichy Victoria's Secret Fresh Simple Dermalogica Skinceuticals Jo Malone YSL Beauty Curci

Jo Malone Jo Malone VSL Beauty Gucci La Noche-Yosay Dermablend Dermablend Seiti Stila Cosmetics Strivectin Strivectin Strivectin Burberry Rimmel London Crinistan Louboutin Kate Somerville Marc. Jacobs Beauty Elizabeth Arden Marc. Jacobs Beauty Elizabeth Arden Marc. Jacobs Beauty Prada Ret Skincare Wet 'n Wild Anastasia Beventy Hills Formula S Cosmetics Nivea Nivea

CHALLENGED

CHALLENGED Artistry Autistry Autistry Sistey Bite Beauty Hugo Boss Juicy Couture Trish McEvoy Aimay Guerfain Of Herriksan Ot Herriksan Ot Herriksan Witco Pondi GaMa Cow Lacoste Donna Karan New Yor Color BEOCA Cosmetics Eau Thermale Avine Hana Ricci

GENIUS Urban Decay Mavbelline New York L'Oréal Paris Lancôme Benefit Cosmetics GIFTED

DIGITAL IQ INDEX® BEAUTY

FEEBLE



GENIUS Urban Decay Maybelline New York L'Oréal Paris Lancôme Benefit Cosmetics Benefit Cosmetics GIFTED Clinique MAC Cosmetics Kiehl's Estée Lauder CoverGirl Olay Bobbi Brown Sally Hansen bareMinerals Smashbox Cosmetics Avon OPI Neutrogena Essie NYX NYX Too Faced Chanel Dior Dove Dove NARS Cosmetics Origins Philosophy Tarte Cosmetics L'Occitane en Provence Revion Revlon Giorgio Armani Beauty Aveda Make Up For Ever Shiseido e.l.f. Cosmetics Garnier Proactiv Charlotte Tilbury Christotte Clarisonic Clarisonic Laura Mercier Murad Kat Von D AVERAGE Calvin Kein Doice & Gabbana Victy Victoria's Secret Presh Bermalogica Skinceuticals Ja Maioney VSL Cauco La Mort La Aoche-Posay Dermablend Mary Kay Bernatoria Stila Cosmetics Strivectin Aveeno Christian Louboutin Kata Somerville Marc Jacobs Beauty Elizabeth Arden Michael Kors Pericone MD Deborah Lipomann La Praite Thierry Mugler RP Prada Rev Strivectin Revery Hills Formula X Wet for Wol CHALLENGED Jimmy Choo butter London Sisley Bite Beauty

Bite Beauty Hugo Boss Juicy Couture Trish McEvoy Almay Guerlain Ole Henriksen Pond's Viktor & Rolf GLAMGLOW GLAMGLOW Lacoste DKNY Fragrances Donna Karan New York Color BECCA Cosmetics Eau Thermale Avène Nina Ricci

Issey Miyake Parfums Jean Paul Gaultier Vera Wang Fragrances

10

SITE & E-COMMERCE DIGITAL IQ INDEX® BEAUTY

Product Merchandising

In the online environment, compelling product merchandising is quickly becoming the "new" product packaging, replacing in-store displays and beauty counter specialists that dominate the offline retail experience. Enhancing product merchandising on site with additional collateral, such as videos (49 percent), howto content (30 percent), and UGC (16 percent) not only extends the reach of these materials but also creates a more effective selling environment.

While not all features make sense for every brand to implement (e.g., displaying products on different skintones), brands should actively consider the types of information and decisions that their consumers make and supply materials accordingly. For example, among Color Cosmetics brands, bareMinerals provides

the most comprehensive product detail pages. A product page for tinted moisturizer includes relevant how-to product videos, as well as a visual link to a shade-matching diagnostic tool. The bareMinerals site also boasts sophisticated user reviews that can be filtered by both reviewer profiles (a feature shared by 24 percent of sites) and product characteristics (12 percent).

Fragrance brands, which typically rely more on splashy product launches and artistic campaigns, can enhance their product merchandising by embedding campaign collateral on relevant product pages, as Giorgio Armani Beauty has done for its Acqua di Gio line.



SITE & E-COMMERCE DIGITAL IQ INDEX® BEAUTY

E-Tailers

While the brand site allows the most explicit influence over the consumer experience, 70 percent of digital buyers still prefer to purchase Beauty products on retailer sites.¹⁷ Furthermore, the average Index brand site attracted only 110 thousand unique site visitors in the month of August—compared to Sephora's 4 million visitors.¹⁸

The majority of Index brands distribute through multiple retailers, imposing a delicate balancing act as brands negotiate with various outlets for their products

17. "<u>2015 Consumer Preferences Survey.</u>" BrandShop, September 17, 2015. 18. Compete.com. (40 percent of Index brands are distributing through all three Beauty behemoths: Sephora, Nordstrom, and Macy's). Regardless of distribution strategy, brands need to optimize merchandising and search visibility on their priority retailers and strategically leverage any enterprise value (i.e., collective bargaining).

Though Amazon is a threat to all prestige Beauty brands and retailers, a unified front has yet to emerge. Each prestige enterprise is taking its own stance, with Estée Lauder and LVMH adopting the "head in sand" approach (and suffering the consequences).



DIGITAL MARKETING DIGITAL IQ INDEX® BEAUTY

Retailers Win in Brand Search

The rift between retailers and brand sites continues to widen. Retailers are continuing to win in search for both specific brand terms (e.g., "Mary Kay") and broader, high-volume category terms (e.g., "best foundation"). Collectively, retail destinations own the largest share of first-page real estate, claiming 45 percent of first-page organic results for Index brand term searches, up from 35 percent last year. In comparison, brand-owned URLs (sites, social properties, and parent company sites) collectively maintain 41 percent ownership.

Of the brand search results owned by retailers, Sephora makes up the largest share (18 percent), followed by a cluster of e-tailers: Nordstrom (12 percent), Amazon (11 percent), Ulta (10 percent), and Macy's (eight percent). Amazon's notable presence among Beauty-specific retailers is a testament to its strength in the space and the growing threat as purchase paths are rerouted from traditional players. With 20 percent of U.S. shoppers of make-up products employing search engines to determine their ultimate purchase decisions (and an additional 10 percent navigating directly to retailers), brands face an increasingly challenging environment in which to maintain parity in search visibility.¹⁹



 "<u>What online sources did people use to make a purchase decision?</u>" Google, The Consumer Barometer Survey 2014-2015, Accessed November 24, 2015.

Source: L2 Digital IQ Index[®]: Beauty, December 2015.

SOCIAL MEDIA DIGITAL IQ INDEX® BEAUTY

Social Media is Not Created Equal

Sixty-five percent of U.S. adults and 76 percent of Internet users access at least one social media platform on a regular basis.²⁰ While the native reach of these platforms varies widely (1.55 billion active monthly users on Facebook, 400 million on Instagram, and 316 million on Twitter),²¹ the engagement that these platforms inspire is not proportional to addressable audience. Instagram, the most visual platform, has repeatedly demonstrated its value to brands in terms of earned media mentions.²²

Instagram engagement has tripled year over year, while its sibling platform, Facebook, has experienced a sizable decline in total engagement following changes to its News Feed algorithm.²³ Facebook has invested heavily in native video in an attempt to grab advertising share from YouTube. With a lagging adoption rate, Pinterest is trying to find relevancy through buyability, rolling out shoppable Pins this year.

Twitter has stagnated in terms of consumer interaction, with its active user base dropping from 12 to eight percent year over year.²⁴ Its foray into live-streaming video, Periscope, has managed to pique the interest of 37 percent of Index brands as a tool for make-up demonstrations, event streaming, and new product promotions. Snapchat is a close second among emerging platforms, with a 34 percent adoption rate.

- 20. "Social Media Usage: 2005-2015," Andrew Perrin, Pew Research Center, October 8, 2015.
- 21. "Leading social networks worldwide," Statista, November 2015.
- 22. "<u>La Mode May Cosmetics Edition</u>," Christina Goswiller and Merissa Ren, Tribe Dynamics, May 2015.
- 23. "Facebook Changes News Feed Algorithm To Prioritize Content From Friends Over Pages." Amit Chowdhry, Forbes, April 23, 2015.
- 24. "<u>Twitter user growth continues to stall.</u>" Laurie Beaver and Margaret Boland, Business Insider, October 28, 2015.

December 17, 2015

Beauty: Share of Total Post Interactions Facebook, Instagram & Twitter

October 2014–October 2015



Source: L2 Digital IQ Index®: Beauty, December 2015.

Mobile Site

At this juncture, over half of Beauty-centric keyword searches are now executed from a mobile device.²⁵ As brands increasingly recognize the mobile customer experience as the "primary" customer experience going forward, investment shifts beyond token investment in mobile site architecture to features and functionality that enhance conversion from mobile screens.

Over half of brands (58 percent) now make the consumer shopping experience more continuous among devices, enabling users to complete a recently saved cart session from another device login. Forty-three percent of brands also expedite the clunky mobile checkout process with PayPal integration.

The Estée Lauder brand's targeted mobile design is particularly noteworthy, where consumers can move through a series of questions leading up to a

25. Google AdWords Keyword Planner Tool.

personalized product where they are prompted to purchase. A mobile-optimized chat button is static at the bottom of every page, providing consumers immediate, specialized support for beauty advice and order inquiries.

The recent spate of brand site re-launches from other Estée Lauder brands (Origins, MAC, and Bobbi Brown) all prioritize the mobile experience—the site architecture is clean and streamlined, free of distractions and clunky navigational elements. Origins, furthermore, adapts its innovative personalized search across screen devices. It's no surprise that the enterprise has thrown its weight behind optimizing the mobile purchase and guided selling experiences: mobile is now more than a third of its e-commerce business.²⁶

26. "Mobile is now more than a third of Estee Lauder's online business." Matt Lindner, Internet Retailer, November 3, 2015.



Source: L2 Digital IQ Index®: Beauty, December 2015.

December 17, 2015



R Estée Lauder's mobile site features a simple, intuitive diagnostic designed with mobile in mind.

Click to jump to: 🤟 5 METHODOLOGY

6 DIGITAL IQ RANKING

- 6 Company of Genius
- **11** Gifted
- 13 Average
- 16 Challenged
- 18 Feeble

19 KEY FINDINGS

- 20 Enterprise Value
- 22 Digital IQ Distribution

23 SITE & E-COMMERCE

- 23 Evolution of Brand Sites
- 24 Guided Selling
- 25 Personalization
- 27 The New Live Chat
- 28 Product Merchandising
- **29 SPOTLIGHT:** Best-in-Class Product Merchandising
- **30** E-Tailers
- **31** Enterprise SKUs on Amzon
- 32 Gray Market SKUs on Amazon
- 33 Amazon Pricing
- 35 Specialty Beauty: Sephora

37 DIGITAL MARKETING

- 37 Retailers Win in Brand Search
- 38 Paid Brand Search
- 39 Leaders in Category Search
- **40** Organic Category Search
- 41 Paid Category Search
- 42 Display Advertising
- 44 CRM
- 45 Email Personalization
- 47 SPOTLIGHT: It's Personal: L'Oréal Paris
- 48 Co-Op Advertising

50 SOCIAL MEDIA

- 50 Social Media is Not Created Equal
- 51 Instagram's Cool Factor
- 52 Anastasia's Golden Goose
- 53 Pay-to-Play on Facebook
- 54 SPOTLIGHT: Benefit Cosmetics vs. CoverGirl: Video Strategy
- 56 The Viral Video Myth
- 57 YouTube Search
- 58 SPOTLIGHT: CoverGirl
- 59 Snapchat & Periscope Experimentation

60 MOBILE

- 60 Mobile Site
- 61 Guided Selling on Mobile

62 FLASH OF GENIUS

- 62 SEO Basics: e.l.f. Cosmetics
- **63** Fulfillment: L'Occitane en Provence, Avon, Lancôme
- 64 Snapchat Test-and-Learn: CoverGirl
- 65 Trippin' with Tarte: Tarte
- 66 Thinking Outside the (Smash)Box: Smashbox
- 67 Personalized Search: Orgins

68 L2 TEAM

69 ABOUT L2

L2 IS A MEMBER-BASED BUSINESS INTELLIGENCE FIRM THAT BENCHMARKS THE DIGITAL PERFORMANCE OF BRANDS.

RESEARCH

Our 70+ annual reports include:

Digital IQ Index®

The definitive benchmark for online competence, Digital IQ Index[®] reports assess the digital performance of the top 60-100 brands across 12 industry verticals and 11 geographies. Brands are ranked against their peers on more than 850 data points diagnosing their digital strengths and weaknesses.

Intelligence Reports

Intelligence Reports complement L2's flagship Digital IQ Index[®] with a deeper dive into the platform or geographies of future growth. Critical areas of investigation include: Mobile, Video, Emerging Platforms, and Omnichannel Retail.

Insight Reports

Series of topical reports complementing the Digital IQ Index[®] and Commerce IQ[®] reports with an in-depth analysis of specific tactics and opportunities.

EVENTS

L2's 60+ global events are the largest gatherings of retail and consumer executives in North America. At our events L2 research leads, academic thought leaders and industry experts provide insight into digital trends, performance and tools.

Executive Education Clinics

L2's version of the one-day M.B.A., our quarterly clinics offer members an in-depth look at the issues, trends, strategies and technologies changing the face of digital.

Research Briefing

Held in cities across the world several times a month, these working breakfast or lunch sessions provide members with data and insights from L2's research portfolio.

A MEMBERSHIP

For membership inquiries: membership@L2inc.com.

December 17, 2015

UPCOMING RESEARCH

Digital IQ Index[®] Reports: Watches & Jewelry

Intelligence Reports Death of Pureplay Retail Social Platforms

Insight Reports Best of Mobile 2015 Retail Innovations: Mobile Payments

UPCOMING EVENTS

The Death of Pure Play Retail January 12, 2016 | New York

Focus 2016 January 15, 2016 | Paris

DLD L2 Academy January 18, 2016 | Munich



CONTACT INFO:

740 Broadway, 5th Floor New York, NY 10003

L2inc.com info@L2inc.com

© L2 2015 L2inc.com / Reproductions Prohibited

This report is the property of L2, Inc.

No copyrighted materials may be reproduced, redistributed, or transferred without prior consent from L2.

L2 reports are available to L2 Members for internal business purposes.